

TRANSPORT ADVISORY COMMITTEE

DRAFT OPEN MINUTES

Minutes of the meeting held at 1.30pm on
In the Liberation room, Secretariat, Stanley

*“These minutes are draft minutes until confirmed by
Resolution at the next meeting of this Committee”*

Present:	Hon Gavin Short (GS)	MLA
	Hon Phyl Rendell (PR)	MLA
	Mr Manfred Keenleyside (MK)	Director of Public Works
	Mr George Betts (GB)	Work Boat Services Representative
	Mr Keith Knight (KK)	West Falklands Representative
	Mr Martin Slater (MS)	General Manager FIDC
	Miss Louise Pole-Evans (LPE)	Islands Representative
	Mr Simon Catton (SC)	Roads Engineer
	Mr David Roberts (DR)	East Representative
	Mr Simon Fletcher (SF)	Director of Central Services
	Mr Morgan Goss (MG)	FIGAS Representative
Minutes:	Ms Karin Sanchez	Administrative Officer

PART I

ACTION

1. Apologies

Mr Owen Betts - Town Representative
Mr Adam Cockwell – Work Boat Services

2. Declarations of Interest

There were two declarations of interest made
Hon Phyl Rendell – Item 8 – Jetties
Miss Louise Pole-Evans – Item 8 - Jetties

3. Confirmation of Open Minutes held on 15 May 2014

Minutes were confirmed with no amendments.

4. Matters Arising from the minutes held on 15 May 2014

Ref 7 – Sea Truck Update

AC submitted a brief report to members on the current situation. Alnmaritec are finalising the production of the parts needed for the modification, due to arrive 6th October. GB informed members that apart from the technician the Mechal regulators will need to give their final approval of the modifications made.

Ref 10. Update on Saunders Airstrip

MG reported that the request to use remaining funds under airstrip maintenance vote has not been done. Treasury advised that the Budget Select Committee has asked the policy to be reviewed and under the current ExCo policy the user pays stands. Unless this is changed they are unable to access these funds for the works. Head of Regulation Bruce Wilks is taking the lead to review this policy with a paper being submitted in September to Executive Council.

5. Highways Projects Update – Simon Catton, Roads Engineer

SC presented the report to members, highlighting the achievement made over the last year.

Cattle grids – Total of 8 cattle grids completed on the East, 6 cattle grids on the West.

West Road Capping - Completed 3.1km of capping/re-build works around Stoney Ridge against a target of 4km. However, the costs increased substantially due to underestimating costs of haulage and the need to install more geotextile than expected.

KK queried the amount of terram used and the thickness of capping material placed due to a comment made by the Assistant Roads Engineer on their site visits. SC reassured members the correct thickness was laid, and the terram has been laid in all the areas that had been considered necessary however the increase in costs resulted from hire of trucks, fuel costs etc.

SC further explained expressions of interest have been sought for works, with interest being shown for each project. Closing date is next week.

PR commented to members she was very pleased to see PWD had implemented using the NEC style contracts. SC further explained this will give contractors the flexibility to set up before commencing works, providing a clear programme of what can be achieved.

Members made further enquiries on what exact locations/areas were on the 5 year programme. SC will provide members with a detailed list (which was much as the schedule included in the funding and resource paper); however as needs and priorities change the locations move up and down the list. SC will also check if Mount Brown area was part of the programme and report back.

LPE reported a cattle grid may need replacing near an area by the old ruin on New Haven. LPE further commented that she thought the bend around is quite dangerous. SC explained this is not on the replacement list as the grid itself is fine and there is warning signage for the bend but will further investigate improvements.

SC further explained there will be no PWD road gang sent to the West this season, just the grading crew as normal.

SC informed members there was a serious culvert failure at Kings Creek on the Salvador road which is passable but with extreme caution. There have also been numerous areas that suffered flooding, and therefore damage to the road and edges. SC has sent out an announcement for the public to be cautious and to let them know PWD highways will repair as soon as possible.

6. Review of Terms of Reference – MLA Gavin Short

Members discussed the additional information now provided with the terms of reference and agreed them.

GS further questioned the procedure on submitting agenda items for the committee, explaining he has been having difficulties and has been asked to provide papers for each item. MK explained to members this is according to the Committees Access to Information Legislation where it requires all items, where possible, to be submitted to a committee with a paper. If this is not possible then the person submitting the item needs to supply a written summary of what it is intended for discussion, with clear concise information such as the topic, the information behind it, to provide a mechanism for discussion.

KK further queried the system as he had requested two items to be discussed, one was covered by the Highways Report, and another was not issued in the agenda. MK advised KK the response for the second item was to be given verbally to him by GS. GS confirmed he had sent an e-mail.

7. Roads to Non-agricultural destinations – Martin Slater, FIDC Manager

MS

MS briefed members as follows.

FIG currently implements a policy to build roads only to occupied farm settlements in the Falkland Islands. This current policy only supports the road requirements for farms and currently excludes other destinations. The idea of an expanded policy being implemented has been discussed previously on two occasions by TAC. Currently there are no funds within FIDC to support this however they have been asked to revisit this topic by FIG and submit a policy paper.

FIDC have consulted with PWD, the Policy Unit and Head of Planning with lots of input being given. The policy unit has also agreed to review this policy once we have a proposal in place.

Members discussed the draft main conditions of this proposal below:

4.1

a) Only applicable to established businesses.

PR responded that as this would exclude anyone wanting to set up a business this should not be recommended. PR further explained MLAs would like to encourage the economy and development of the Falkland Islands. This should therefore be applicable to everyone willing to establish something new as well as existing businesses. Members agreed this condition could be altered to potentially include all businesses existing or new.

b) The cost of constructing the road is split equally between FIG and the private sector (with the private sector contribution potentially being in-kind)

MK suggested a sliding scale be implemented rather than a fixed rate, as proposals and wider benefits are likely to vary and a sliding scale could take into consideration the amount of investments and benefits.

SF commented that the policy should not leave FIG open to a road being required for a company that has the means to cover all the costs themselves. But for each case to be assessed as a case by case as the budget would be limited for each scenario.

MG queried if there was to be a distance from Stanley that this policy would be applicable to. MK commented this policy is intended to support further development in camp, and this could link to RDS definition?

MS further explained the key point for the justification of a road is there is a financial benefit.

Members discussed and agreed the cost of construction of road should be assessed using a sliding scale depending on the value of the economic benefit and returns generated.

c) Once built the road becomes a public highway

MK commented this should not be an absolute explaining there may be circumstances that there may be some value; with others not having a public benefit due to it being only used by the business requesting the road. By maintaining these as public highways FIG would then become responsible for the maintenance of a road which longer term may cost more than the road itself and may be only used by a handful of people and be of no benefit to the rest of the population.

PR and GS queried would not every highway be a benefit to remain in the public domain. SF also commented this is public funds being used for just one business. MK said that the road being built would be a part of the overall package to help the development of that business and the economy of the Falklands, with the above criteria of it being financially beneficial. MK further answered SF comments that there are other private projects which are fully funded and supported by FIG as an overall development of businesses within the Islands and the roads provided here would be a small part of that.

d) FIG take responsibility for maintaining the road once it is constructed

Members agreed that if it becomes a public highway then FIG normally assumes responsibility for maintenance. MK said specifications and material used would need to be agreed to ensure the cost of maintenance does not escalate.

e) FIG to allocate a dedicated annual budget for the 'Roads to Non-agricultural Destinations'

Member agreed funding could be allocated through the Rural Development Scheme for management. PR commented that this would need to be additional funds as there is no current budget for this. MS suggested the funding should be agreed for one or two roads per year.

f) Applicants have to demonstrate the economic benefit of the road is equal or greater than the initial FIG financial construction contribution to the cost of the road over 25 years

Members agreed as above minute category b. MS will consult further with the policy unit.

g) Roads to be built by the private sector

Agreed with the above conditions of specifications and materials used.

h) Applicants will need to demonstrate that the proposed construction will meet the aims and objectives of the EDS, RDS and/or TDS

Members agreed this should be part of the application process and consistent with the financial support given where appropriate.

i) Applications related to tourism must be fully compliant with the schemes and initiatives of the Falkland Islands Tourist Board

MK commented this may be outside the scope of what that business is focusing on and trying to implement. After discussing further members agreed to remove this point as the Tourist Board initiatives are part of the TDS.

j) Applicants to include an environmental impact assessment in roads to non-agricultural destinations applications

Members agreed further consultation with the Planning department was needed as it may not be applicable to all businesses.

MS concluded and summarised the points agreed are to: have an annual budget to support the construction of 1 or 2 roads per year. Each application to be judged on a case by case with the above merits set. Each case will be prioritised depending on the delivery of a return then it would be put ahead of the next application. Over time each road will have been built based on these priorities.

MS will re-write the paper and seek further input from the Tourist Board and RBA. A cost benefit analysis is also to be produced. To be submitted at the next TAC.

8. Potential significant agenda items for the next meeting - 1. Jetties and ramps review

MK explained to members that this was to open the debate on additional works on existing jetties/ramps and if new jetties/ramps might be added to the list, as this review had been requested and there is a need for a mechanism by which we can review the policy and via that mechanism consider people's proposals fairly. There has been some useful input from Work Boat Services. There have also been cases in which people have carried out work on their own already and the policy agreed may be that we do not fully fund all works. **MK**

PR questioned if there is a survey in place. MK answered there is a schedule of installations in place, which ones might need improvements etc from Work Boat Services. The information will be collated into a table which can be presented at the next meeting.

GB suggested the number one priority should be that the facility is suitable for use by Concordia Bay. If they cannot accommodate the sea truck then focus on ramps suitable for this. Jetties no longer fit in with the current transport provided, GB suggested that building ramps which can then withstand the pressure of 7 tonnes of the Concordia Bay ramp would be ideal. If this is not possible then building ramps suitable for the sea truck.

GB explained the current operation is quite different from what preceded it and is still developing. It was obviously preferable to do all transfers directly from Concordia Bay but some sites simply are not suitable and survey would be needed to determine best sites and which facilities could be improved.

9. Funding allocation and procurement strategy for PWD Highways – ExCo paper 132/14.

SC ran through the key point of this paper.

- a) the tendering of a 3 year contract for haulage of capping materials for the MPA road
- b) the tendering of a 4 year contract for haulage of material for the North Camp road rebuild
- c) tendering of a three year contract to cover work to the B category, North Arm road
- d) tendering of a five year contract to cover work, to the A category road, Fox Bay to Port Howard
- e) to allocate the funding as agreed in appendix B of the paper

Members agreed the programme is ambitious but they are happy to see what can be achieved,

SC explained they are currently investigating materials and looking for best supply. Trial holes have been drilled, to establish amount of overburden and

extent of deposits and material testing is being done of samples extracted. Trying to find the best can sometimes mean longer hauling distances.

MK commented that PWD try and strike a balance between choosing materials that are more durable at a longer distance of haulage, versus a material that breaks down more easily and is closer by. The system that will be used for upgrading and capping where possible is intended to be to haul out on capped/upgraded sections of road, rather than haul over existing unimproved road sections and therefore breaking it down.

11. Date of Next Meeting

Next meeting to be held October/early November. Date to be confirmed.

12. Exclusion of Press and Public

The public are likely to be excluded from the meeting for this/these item(s) of business by virtue of paragraph(s) 15 and 17 of Schedule 3 of the Committees (Public Access) Ordinance 2012]

The Chairman to move as follows:

"I move that the press and public be now excluded on the ground that the next items of business to be considered are likely to disclose exempt information under paragraphs 15 and 17 of schedule 3 of the Committees (Public Access) Ordinance 2012."

PART 2

13. Confirmation of exempt minutes from the meeting held on the 15 May 2014
NOT FOR PUBLICATION by virtue of paragraph 15 and 17 of Schedule 3 of the Committees (Public Access) Ordinance 2012, relating to draft papers for Executive Council and information about them, and budgetary information

Minutes confirmed with no amendments.